



Ryan White Title I HIV Health Services Planning Council

Donna Bryant, Chair
1845 East Roosevelt Street
Phoenix, AZ 85006
(623) 247-4390 phone
(623) 849-9410 fax
sweetdbryant@msn.com

Planning Council Support
1845 East Roosevelt Street
Phoenix, AZ 85006
(602) 506-6321 phone
(602) 506-6885 fax
johnsapero@mail.maricopa.gov

PLANNING COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES

Thursday, December 9, 2004
4:00 p.m. to 6:00 p.m.
Maricopa Medical Center
2601 East Roosevelt St.

Draft

The following provides a written summary of the minutes recorded. To listen to the official recorded minutes, contact Planning Council Support. The tape(s) will be provided for review.

MEMBERS, GUESTS and STAFF

Present: Marc Allan, Elizabeth Ashby, Bob Baily, Cindy Vargo (alternate for Michelle Barker), James Bryant, Marti Cutler, Randall Furrow, Kimberley Bickes (alternate for Deborah Frusciano), Damon Gunn, Barr Jenkins, Lonnie Jones, Mark Kezios, Cheri Thomlinson (alternate for Helen Lansche), Arcadio Madero, Eric Moore, Mike Mangen, John Murray, Tara Radke, James Reed, Glen Spencer, Larry Stahli, Maclovio Zepeda (alternate for Louie Tapia), Keith Thompson, Cynthia Trottier, Jonathan Weisbuch, David Paquette, Terri Leija (alternate for Mary Rose Wilcox), MiAsia Pasha, Stacey Marsden, Bertha Sintillo, Matthew Heil, Sharyn Grayson, Rob Bartlett, George Garcia, Billy Leeth, Bill Parker, Steve Varnadore, Lynn R., Jen Leitch, Rosie Nunez, Marla Wing, Lee Cox, Jose Moreno, Bill Parker, John Sapero, Ellissa Babasick

Excused: Donna Bryant, Erica Avery, Juan Carrasco, Orlando Escobar, Stephen O'Dell, Fran Garrett, Carol Williams

Absent: Elbert Bernal, Carlos Cantu Pinon, Clarence Tucker, John Wynant

WELCOME & INTRODUCTIONS

Mark Kezios called the meeting to order at approximately 4:05 p.m. He welcomed everybody and asked everyone to introduce him/her self.

DETERMINATION OF QUORUM

Quorum was established at 4:10 pm by John Murray and Planning Council Support.

REVIEW AND APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES FROM NOVEMBER 18, 2004

Eric Moore related that on page 8, "The committee also emeritus board..." should be "The committee also discussed emeritus board..."

MOTION: Glen Spencer motioned to approve the minutes as corrected. Larry Stahli seconded.

DISCUSSION: None.

OUTCOME: The motion passed.

ADMINISTRATIVE AGENT UPDATE

The Administrative Agent (AA) discussed that Maricopa County Department of Public Health has sent their response to the HRSA Site Visit Report.

At the request of the Allocations Chair, letters were sent to contractors asking them to determine if they will have any unspent funds. They have all responded and the amount available for "scoop up" is about \$10,400. The Allocations Committee has determined to use any unspent funds returned by contractors to buy pharmaceuticals.

There is a review team currently looking at the proposals for Targeted Outreach (African-American) and Food Services. We should know more about who will be awarded the contract in the next few days.

At the last Allocations Committee meeting, Douglas Walter, Program Analyst, asked for a reconsideration of the designation of next year's Minority AIDS Initiative (MAI) funding. Food Services received part of this designation, but because of the guidelines that must be followed to use these funds, the AA's office is concerned that it will be difficult, if not impossible, for a contractor to provide MAI-designated services in this service category. The AA's office has asked the Allocations Committee to consider reassigning MAI funding to another category.

The carry-over request from last year has not been approved yet. After reading recent meeting minutes, our HRSA Project Officer has asked David Paquette to convey that perhaps the Council would like to consider funding Dental Services with some or all of these funds rather than buying pharmaceuticals.

Lonnie Jones asked what the AA's recommendation would be. He deferred to Laurie Buckles, Director of the Office of Oral Health for Maricopa County. She related that if additional funds were available now, up to 16 new people could be enrolled in the program, or it may be possible to change the financial eligibility requirements for all current clients. However, there would be no value to increasing the program unless funding for next year is increased from its currently proposed allocation, otherwise new clients enrolled now would be dropped from the program at the beginning of the new grant year. She will discuss this in her presentation.

Jonathan Weisbuch discussed that if this money pays for pharmaceuticals, there would not be any challenge with adding/subtracting clients – the product would be available to those who need it.

Sharyn Grayson asked if dental and pharmaceuticals services are the only options, or can this money go to other services? The AA discussed that purchasing pharmaceuticals provides the greatest utility for the money but the funds can be reallocated to any category.

Keith Thompson asked that if this money is used to pay for pharmaceuticals, will it reduce the amount of money we would need to spend on pharmaceuticals from the new grant award? The AA discussed that this could be true.

MOTION: Keith Thompson motioned to keep the carry-over funds designated to purchase pharmaceuticals. Larry Stahli seconded the motion.

DISCUSSION: Sharyn Grayson asked that, given the difficulty in determining the allocations for next year, are there other areas these funds could be used for? The AA discussed that this would have to be approved by HRSA, and then the funds would have to be put into contract quickly and spent in two months. If we put the funds into a service category such as Pharmaceuticals, it can be spent easily and efficiently. Bob Baily added that if these funds went to another service category, the contractor(s) would take on new clients for two months, and then have to cut services to these clients in the new grant year, as the funding would no longer be there.

John Murray asked if applying these funds to purchase pharmaceuticals would “open up” funds from the new grant award. Could these funds then be used to address emerging needs in other service categories? The AA responded that the Council can reallocate funds at any time and this could be done. However, for the carry-over request, we must be very specific on how the funds will be spent.

Tara Radke asked that if we tell the Project Officer we wish to continue to purchase pharmaceuticals with these funds, will she hold up the carry-over request, or did she just want an extra effort made to bring this to the Council's consideration? The AA responded that this is merely something she has asked be conveyed to the Council.

OUTCOME: The motion passed.

VICE-CHAIR UPDATE

HRSA Site Visit Report response: Mark Kezios discussed that the PC Chair has received an extension to complete her response to the Planning Council-related sections of the Report. We do not know what her response is – no one has seen it yet. The Executive Committee discussed this issue at their last meeting and is waiting to see what happens. If the response is not provided to HRSA, the Executive Committee will meet and formulate a response as a group.

FINAL DETERMINATION OF WHETHER TO RECOMMEND THE REMOVAL OF THE PLANNING COUNCIL CHAIR FROM THE MEMBERSHIP OF THE COUNCIL

Mark Kezios discussed that the PC Chair responded to the initial vote to remove her from the membership of the Council. Her written response has been included in the packet of materials provided for the meeting. The Council will hold a final vote to determine whether to recommend to the Board of Supervisors to remove Donna Bryant from the Planning Council membership. Whatever the outcome of the vote, a letter will be sent to the Board of Supervisors detailing the decision.

Marla Wing asked why the vote was taking place. Eric Moore discussed that a group of Planning Council members had drafted a Memorandum that was the basis for this action and outlined some of the reasons the vote was taking place.

Jim Reed discussed that he did not feel that Donna Bryant's response addressed the issues outlined in the Memorandum, and that there has been a subordination of the EMAs interest to the concerns of one person. He discussed that, additionally, Donna has evidently not lived in the EMA for the past five months.

Gregg Levendoski discussed that while he felt Donna Bryant has done good things in the past, for the past six months she has done a great disservice to the EMA.

MOTION: Gregg Levendoski motioned to remove Donna Bryant from the membership of the Planning Council. The motion was seconded by Randall Furrow.

DISCUSSION: John Murray discussed that unless there is confirmation that Donna does not live in the EMA, this information should not be considered. Jim Reed responded that it was stated in the Memorandum document, and other communications, that she had not been living in the EMA. Donna had not disputed this. John Murray replied that she's never confirmed this either.

Mark Kezios discussed that Donna has not been available to respond to this issue. Gregg Levendoski reiterated that she has not responded to any of the Planning Council concerns about her actions.

Eric Moore discussed that, in a recent email, our HRSA Project Officer made a statement that the Letter of Assurance was THE reason behind the recommendation to remove the Chair. He clarified that the Letter of Assurance happened after the Memo was written and after this process was started. If the Letter played any part in this vote, it was the proverbial "straw that broke the camel's back." He also stressed that this has never been about who Donna is. It is about what she has done.

Marla Wing asked for additional clarification as to why the vote was taking place – was the Council removing the person from office, or removing the Chair position from the Council? Mark Kezios responded that the vote was to remove the person from the Council, but keep the position of Chair intact. A new PC Chair will be elected in January to take office in March.

A guest asked when was the last time Donna Bryant had attended a meeting? It was discussed that the last PC meeting she attended was in June, and the last Executive Committee meeting she attended was in September.

Maclovia Zepeda discussed that there is a huge gap in the Bylaws regarding the removal of a member from office, and asked the Rules Committee to address this issue. Eric Moore related that the Rules Committee had tried to do this, but Donna Bryant had strongly objected to any changes in the Bylaws concerning this issue and the committee had deferred to her. Maclovia restated the need to address these issues in the Bylaws, as there is currently no process to remove someone from office and allow them to remain on the Council.

Marc Allan discussed that if any PC member had not attended meetings as Donna has done, they would be considered to have voluntarily resigned from the membership. Eric Moore clarified that this would be true if the absences were unexcused.

Sharyn Grayson asked that if a person is removed as a Chair of a sub-committee, are they allowed to stay on the Planning Council? Eric Moore related that they were still members if this occurred.

Jim Reed discussed that every alternative was pursued to avoid this vote, and that Donna's conduct has undermined the functionality of the Planning Council.

Bob Bailly discussed that because she does not return emails or phone calls, Donna has stymied committees to move forward on addressing issues. There have been attempts to resolve these issues with her, but she has not responded.

OUTCOME: The motioned passed as follows:

19 in favor of the removal (17 votes plus 2 proxy votes).

5 against the removal (4 Cast votes plus 1 proxy vote).

4 abstentions.

Marc Allan asked when the removal of Donna Bryant will be effective? Mark Kezios and Terri Leija discussed that it is effective upon the action of the Board of Supervisors (BOS). Marc Allan then asked if Mark Kezios, as Acting Chair, could respond to the Site Visit Report on behalf of the Council? Mark Kezios related that the Executive Committee would act on this once the BOS had determined their course of action.

ELECTION TO FILL THE VACANT EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE POSITION OF SECRETARY

Eric Moore and Glen Spencer were nominated for Secretary for the remainder of the available term, which concludes on February 28th, 2005.

Glen Spencer and Eric Moore provided a brief introduction of themselves.

After the vote was tallied, Eric Moore was welcomed as the new Secretary.

CALL FOR NOMINATIONS FOR THE 2005-2007 EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE

The following nominations were voiced during the meeting:

Nominations for PC Chair: Mark Kezios

Nominations for Vice-Chair: Maclovía Zepeda, Fran Garrett, Eric Moore

Nominations for Treasurer: John Murray, Glen Spencer

Nominations for Secretary: Eric Moore

Nominations for General Public

(self-identifies as HIV+): Marc Allan, Gregg Levendoski, Randall Furrow

PRESENTATIONS

Title I Dental Program: Laurie Buckles, Director of the Office of Oral Health for Maricopa County, and Carolyn Romero, Coordinator for the Ryan White Dental Program, provided an overview of the current Title I Dental Program and discussed changes that will occur in the next grant year (copies of the presentation slideshow are available from PCS).

On March 1st, 2005, to stay within the allocated budget and not reduce benefits, eligibility criteria for dental services will change to 150% of the federal poverty level (an individual will be eligible for benefits if their annual income does not exceed \$13,964), from 200% of the federal poverty level. Roughly 250 people from upper-income brackets will lose eligibility and these individuals will be helped to secure services from other sources. Other options that are possible: Individual benefits could be decreased; the calendar maximum could be reduced to \$1200, from \$1500; more concise eligibility documents could be required to be supplied by the clients; or "scoop-up" funds could be used to buy dental services prior to the beginning of the new grant year.

It was asked if there was a way to offer the people who might lose benefits the opportunity to pay for their insurance at a reduced rate? In response, the Administrative Agent discussed that it is not possible to charge for a public service and the government does not have the ability to create a payment system.

It was asked what would happen if the "scoop up" funds were used to provide additional payments. How would the program be impacted? Laurie Buckles responded that this would need to be reviewed, based on a dollar value provided.

Community Planning Group (CPG) Update: *(While the second presentation was being readied, the Community Planning Group representative provided their update)*

The CPG has changed their meeting location to the AAA/Care Directions conference room, 1366 E. Thomas Rd. On Saturday, December 4th, 2004, the group had a very successful retreat. A consultant presented a CPG 101 training session in the morning, and the afternoon was spent completing consensus building and teambuilding activities. The Group is currently reviewing and revising their Bylaws.

The State-Wide AIDS Group (SWAG) meetings, normally attended only by CPG Chairs and executive members, are now open to the public and will be held in Phoenix. A schedule of meeting times/locations will be provided.

Title IV: Jen Lee provided an update of Title IV (the part of the Ryan White CARE Act that provides services for women, infants, children and youth). The goal of Title IV is to get women and youth into care, keep them in care, and make them aware of clinical trials opportunities (copies of the presentation slideshow are available from PCS).

Of note:

- Title IV clients are more likely to have been exposed by heterosexual contact.
- The Title IV program is serving a higher percentage of minority families than is represented by the EMA's epidemic.

- Title IV funds testing services at the Maricopa County Department of Public Health and care services at both the Bill Holt Clinic at Phoenix Children's Hospital and the McDowell Clinic. Title IV also funds a family advocate, a case manager, and a clinical trials coordinator, and provides a social worker at Phoenix Children's Hospital.

COMMUNITY UPDATES

Community Planning Group (CPG): This update was provided earlier in the meeting and is described above.

SUB-COMMITTEE UPDATES

Allocations Committee: Bob Baily related that the committee discussed whether to split Behavior Health and Substance Abuse into two separate service categories. After much discussion, the committee determined to keep the services listed within a single category. Also, RJ Shannon provided a presentation on targeted outreach funds that may be available from other sources.

The committee was also made aware that the Minority AIDS Initiative (MAI) designation to funds in the Food Services category may present challenges to the procurement and provision of this service. The committee will review this at their next meeting, which will take place on January 12th, 2005. Bob encouraged consumers to attend and take part in the meeting.

Community Planning and Assessment Committee: Larry Stahl discussed that the first part of the Request of Qualifications (for development of the survey tool) for the 2005 Needs Assessment is going through the procurement process. The committee will be creating the second part of the request (which will involve the data collection, analysis and reporting) at their next meeting.

Consumer Advocacy Committee: Cynthia Trottier discussed that the committee is developing an educational program to be presented in March. They are also working with the Department of Public Health to arrange "doc talks" hosted in-part by the Planning Council.

Evaluations Committee: Michelle Barker discussed that she is currently Vice Chair of the committee and was willing to Chair the committee, if the Council desired. A committee meeting will be scheduled in January. Mark Kezios, as Acting Chair, appointed Michelle as Chair of the committee.

Membership Committee: John Murray introduced four people that the Membership Committee is recommending to the Board of Supervisors for appointment on the Council: Bertha Sintillo, MiAsia Pasha, Maclovio Zepeda and Stacey Marsden. The committee is also discussing how to create an Associate Membership level for the Council. This will be proposed to the Rules Committee at their next meeting.

Marc Allan asked what was being done to encourage existing members to become more involved. John Murray responded that the committee is researching ways to encourage better participation from the current members and developing ways to outreach into the community.

Rules Committee: Larry Stahli related that the committee will meet on December 22nd, 2004, and will begin to review and revise the Bylaws to create a series of checks and balances to Planning Council functions and will review the authority granted to Executive Committee officers.

CALL TO THE PUBLIC

Mark Kezios discussed that HRSA has offered Technical Assistance (TA) to address cultural competency, addressing unmet needs and evaluating the Council's processes. Planning Council Support has been instructed to begin coordinating this. Also, there is an upcoming HRSA teleconference that the public is welcome to participate in.

NAPWA has distributed a questionnaire regarding Ryan White funding. It is available from PCS.

Billy Leeth discussed that they have begun a series of technical assistance trainings for providers and consumers. There will be an upcoming presentation on methamphetamine and HIV disease – contact Steve Varnadore, 602 506-6383 for more information about upcoming presentations. There will be two forums discussing antiretrovirals and how they affect the body coming up on December 15th and 16th, 2004. The first presentation is in English; the second will be conducted in Spanish.

John Murray discussed that there is an agency in Chicago that wants to co-host an HIV fundraising event in February. There is a meeting of services organizations at Arizona OIC on December 15th, 2004 to discuss this event in greater detail.

A request was made that the Planning Council consider holding meetings at a later time, as some people work until 5:00 pm and the current meeting time makes attendance difficult. Mark Kezios discussed that this will be considered.

Gregg Levendoski thanked the participants for everything they make possible for people with HIV and wished everyone a happy holiday.

ADJOURN

The meeting adjourned at approximately 6:00 pm.